

IFAC wishes to publish papers related to automatic control theory and its application to all types of system. The articles accepted for publication in *Automatica* must be of high quality. They cannot be rejected without documented justification. This review form has been prepared to help you, a selected, qualified referee, to provide objective comments on which a timely and just decision can be based.

If you do not have the time personally to review the paper within the allotted time on the review form, please see if one of your qualified associates or students can review the paper. If not, please return the paper via AIR MAIL at your earliest convenience so that we may find an alternative reviewer.

PAPER FOR REVIEW

NUMBER:

TITLE:

AUTHORS:

I OVERALL EVALUATION

A. Contribution: Significant _____ Tutorial _____ Possible _____ Minor _____ None _____

B. Quality: Excellent _____ Good _____ Fair _____ Poor _____

II RECOMMENDATION (Please read page 2, then check appropriate statements below)

_____ A. **Publish**; minor revisions by author or editor require no re-review.

_____ B. **Publish; provided** significant changes are made as indicated by referee's comments. Revised manuscript to be carefully checked by associate editor, and referee if necessary, to determine acceptability. Complete re-review not required. (Do you need to re-review this paper? _____ Yes _____ No.)

_____ C. **Not publishable in present form.** Complete rewriting is required as indicated by referee's comments on page 3. Re-review is required. (Note to referee: The author must be convinced with specific reasons that your recommendation to rewrite is logical and objective.)

_____ D. **Reject because:** _____1. Contribution is obscure, _____2. Results already in references listed with referee's comments, _____3. Results are incorrect as described, _____4. Other; describe briefly in space on page 2 under confidential comments to the Editorial Staff.

III CATEGORY: IF PUBLISHABLE. THE ARTICLE SHOULD BE PUBLISHED AS A:

_____ Paper _____ Brief Paper _____ Technical Communique

(Note: These categories are defined on page 2)

IV PRIZE PAPER AWARD

Should this paper be considered for an Automatica Prize Paper Award? _____ Yes _____ No

V SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS and COMMENTS FOR AUTHOR

Specific comments to be sent to the author should be written, without identifying yourself, on pages 3 and 4.

Eventually, a copy of the decision will be sent by an associate editor to each referee for a comparison of comments.

PLEASE RETURN THIS FORM BEFORE _____

TO _____

AT _____

Referee's Signature _____

Name (block letters) _____

Address _____

_____ Date _____

INFORMATION FOR REFEREES OF PAPERS FOR AUTOMATICA

- You undoubtedly appreciate the importance of minimizing publication delays to provide papers of current interest. Therefore it is important that you complete this review form as soon as possible. Relatively short review delays may delay publication of a paper by more than two months. Hopefully the enclosed paper is related to your previous or present activities to make the review relatively interesting and useful to you. However please note: an author retains the rights to his *unpublished* work, and his results and ideas must not be used by a referee for his own research publications if they are obtained exclusively through the reviewing process.

- Please prepare your comments to the author using pages 3 and 4 attached and additional plain sheets if necessary. Please do not identify yourself or your organization on pages 3 or 4. The following points are suggested for your comments:

(a) What is the contribution of the paper? (b) Is the significance of the paper explained relative to previous work? (c) Is the paper clearly written and well organized? (d) Does the Introduction state the purpose of the paper? (e) Are the references relevant and complete? *Please supply missing references.* (f) If the paper is not technically sound, why not? (g) If the paper is too long, *how can it be shortened?*

- Please supply any information which you think will be useful to the author in revision, in enhancing the appeal of the paper, or in convincing him of his mistakes.

- *The reviewer's recommendation for acceptance or rejection should appear only on the first page of this review form and not in the comments to the author.*

- Automatica publishes three types of papers as defined below:

Paper — Presentation of significant research, development or application of control concepts to any type of system. Note that they may be tutorial, survey, or expository articles (≤ 10 printed pages; although tutorial and survey papers may be longer).

Brief Paper — A concise description of new technical concepts (≤ 6 printed pages).

Technical Communique — Letter to the Editor, comments on established control topics, discussion of published papers (≤ 4 printed pages).

- CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS TO THE AUTOMATICA EDITORIAL STAFF

(Paper Number _____)

(Do not write paper review in this space; include only remarks about the paper for the editorial staff and not for the author)

- **IFAC** and the Automatica Editorial Staff are indeed grateful to referees for their efforts in maintaining the high quality of papers which are published in Automatica. We thank you for whatever assistance you can give in evaluating the enclosed manuscript.

automatica

PAPER REVIEW

REFEREE'S COMMENTS *(To be sent to author)*

Paper Number _____

(Suggestions to the referee: Please do the following: 1) answer the questions below, 2) briefly state your version of the contribution being made. and 3) indicate to the author any corrections which should be made and describe how the paper can be improved with revisions or rewriting.)

- a) Does the Introduction state the purpose of the paper? _____
- b) Is the significance of the paper explained relative to previous work? _____
- c) Is the paper clearly written and well organized? _____
- d) Briefly, the contribution of the paper appears to be the following:

e) **Suggestions for Improving paper:**

(over)

REFEREE'S COMMENTS (For Author)
(USE EXTRA PAGE IF NECESSARY)

Paper Number _____